What place does digital inclusion have in digital literacy?

Tinder Foundation/CILIP ILG TeachMeet
Facilitator Summary Report
February 2016
Introduction

This is a summary report of a TeachMeet event organised jointly between Tinder Foundation and the Information Literacy Group (ILG) of the Chartered Institute of Library and Information Professionals (CILIP). The free event was designed to benefit individuals working in the library sector who are involved in the field of digital inclusion and its role in digital literacy. The aim of the TeachMeet was to provide delegates from public, academic and further education libraries with the opportunity to network and share advice and ideas around the subjects of digital inclusion and digital literacy. Two TeachMeets were organised, one in London and one in Leeds with just under 40 delegates attending each event.

The format of each event included two informal peer-led learning opportunities, each including three 10 minute presentations followed by 45 minutes of group discussions around six themes nominated by public library delegates prior to the event. The six themes include: Basic digital skills for the over 50s; Using social media effectively; Use of volunteers for digital sessions; Welfare reform – digital by default support by library staff; Using different digital devices; and Keeping staff up-to-date with new apps and digital services

The summary notes presented in this report are based on the discussions of the people attending the TeachMeets and it is anticipated the event will serve as a catalyst for further work in this area between Tinder Foundation and CILIP’s Information Literacy Group.
**Discussion Outcomes**

**Theme 1) Basic digital skills for the over 50s**

It was considered that the over 50s were a very broad age group, however overall it was felt that the main basic digital skills for this age range would be emailing, Skype, and online banking.

Libraries who support the lower half of this age group (i.e. 50-70 year olds) have found that they require further skills particularly around supporting job seekers/professionals. For example, people who had worked in industrial careers who were now looking for a new job either need digital skills to find a job, or require digital skills to do the job. Many public libraries run job clubs and digital skills are embedded in their delivery - activities include job searching and applying for jobs online, using Universal Job Match (UJM) and applying for Universal Credit (UC) online. Learn My Way (LMW) was not used by all, but Derbyshire Libraries embeds LMW into all their job clubs and is the stepping stone before referral to one-to-one support on their Work and Money project.

In the 70+ group, relevant support was considered to be more focussed on how to use government services, social media to communicate with family/friends, paying utility bills (and save money), digital health skills, and shopping online. Libraries had found that the 70+ group were more resistant to using the internet and had concerns about security and personal data e.g. unwilling to use Facebook as it required providing and displaying their birthday.

At the Leeds event it was discussed that despite clear differences in the audiences of public (general public) and academic (students and staff) libraries, both agree that the staff who are delivering support need to be upskilled before they can teach others confidently and effectively. Public libraries in particular are reliant on volunteers to deliver basic digital skills, but often don’t initially have the correct skills/knowledge to be able to teach these skills. Volunteer reliability was also raised as a challenge. Some of these issues have been further discussed in the other TeachMeet themes summarised below.

Learners are increasingly coming into libraries asking staff to do online activities for them, in particular government services and UC was identified as an ‘impact’ on library resources and uses up valuable time - this identified that it’s important for learners to learn how to use these things themselves. This
relates to general challenges faced by libraries around lack of resources and not having enough equipment, as well as lack of staff, as highlighted by the need for volunteers which may not always provide a consistent service.

Other challenges:
- Multiplicity of devices used by learners - staff may not know how to use every device.
- A need to join up strategies across the council i.e. customer service and channel shift.
- In some of the larger authorities rurality is a big challenge.
- Older learners were found to lack confidence.
- Lack of access to broadband or devices at home to utilise newfound skills (the Get Online at Home page on Learn My Way is useful here).

A wealth of examples and ideas were given as how to combat some of the issues and challenges in providing basic digital skills. For example, specific sessions for older learners - including both group and one-to-ones - based on subjects which they are interested in, such as saving money, bills and family history. Social groups created online allow users to communicate outside of the library and carry on learning.

Using a ‘hook’ subject to attract learners was considered an important element to engaging in digital skills, such as photography, e-books/magazines/newspapers (using programmes such as Zinio and Press Display), audio books, genealogy, Skype and booking holidays. The hook idea was taken further with ‘Leisure Learning’ - a great engagement tool where classes, based on on leisure subjects not necessarily associated with digital skills, could be used as the hook with digital skills brought in as an element of the learning e.g. hosting a cooking class where learners have to search for the recipe online.

Language barriers were discussed as an issue to learning digital skills. The British Council and Tinder Foundation's English My Way is particularly useful here. Language was also a barrier to actually getting attendance to sessions. One library's solution was creating pictorial rather than text-based marketing material - especially useful for reaching learners with dementia or dyslexia too.
Partnerships have proved fruitful in both engaging learners and attracting volunteers. Examples included:

- Age UK
- Adult & Family Learning
- Jobcentre Plus
- Barclays Digital Eagles (Bolton Libraries and Barnsley Libraries have received funding to install WiFi)
- Schools/colleges/universities to utilise ‘intergenerational learning’ and attract volunteers
- Libraries and social housing providers could do more to work together to increase reach not just with the over 50’s

Attendees were keen for Tinder Foundation and/or CILIP to run a national campaign with adverts, etc. Get Online Week and Be Online are good examples of what we’re doing already. Partnerships could strengthen the impact of any promotional campaign. Social media was used by The Hive, Worcester, for promotion although they understood that people who don’t use the internet cannot see the post, they therefore rely on older people’s children/grandchildren to pass on the message.

**Theme 2) Using social media effectively**

The workshop identified that libraries actively use a variety of social media platforms, with the majority using Facebook and Twitter. Many had a Facebook account per library, and a single Twitter account from the central organisation. Other social media accounts included Pinterest, Flickr, Instagram, YouTube and blogs, all of which have been used to varying degrees of success.

Social media is used by libraries as a conduit to market and promote themselves and their activities, report problems, network and build reputations, and promote the online services which libraries provide, such as renewing books, reserving titles and ordering e-Books. The target audiences being not just necessarily learners, but also partners and stakeholders. As such the use of social media by libraries was considered to not be an “optional extra”.

Despite the widespread use of a number of social media tools, some libraries were unsure on how to understand whether they are being successful in their use and making an impact for libraries. Some ideas for measuring success were discussed, such as monitoring ‘virtual’ transactions compared to ‘real world’ transactions to see how the ratio changes over time. Without
understanding the success, or realising the benefits of social media, it could be difficult for libraries to use or adapt their social media effectively.

The conversations raised a number of other challenges which libraries and their staff faced in the effective use of social media. Some centred around staff challenges, such as lack of digital competencies of staff to use social media, and a lack of ‘buy in’ by staff i.e. seen as an additional ask of time, but also an issue of cultural and personal confidence. Other institutional challenges include central barriers around social media accounts and content, combined with marketing/comm’s or approval routes or ‘Social Media Gatekeepers’ which remove the personal, local or individual voice. Other challenges included:

- Online safety concerns - privacy and security
- Keeping up-to-date with technology and social media
- How to engage with audiences effectively (content creation and the ‘cool factor’)
- Users with different skill levels/English levels
- Fear of legal compliance/libel/acceptable use
- Resourcing

It was widely realised that the effective use of social media could have an impact across the library service. For library learners, social media use could aid in connecting people, sharing information, taking control i.e. jobseekers, and a variety of aspects of research and personal hobbies. For library staff again it would aid in connecting people (users, partners and stakeholders), sharing information, marketing, scheduling, understanding and targeting audiences, and linking to national campaigns to raise local library profile and presence.

Libraries are already effectively using social media and cases of best practice were shared such as Solihull Libraries approach to targeted social media campaigns around specific events e.g. ‘Soliday’ where social media was used to record what happens in one day on Solihull. It was considered that a social media campaign shouldn’t be an organic thing, but should be planned around what libraries want to talk about and promote during the year. A way of making the most of this would be to tie themes into existing marketing campaigns with partners like Tinder Foundation’s Get Online Week or Be Online campaign. This allows libraries to ‘piggy-back’ off existing social media campaigns, including marketing collateral and resources.
Theme 3) Use of volunteers for digital sessions

The use of volunteers was a recurring theme throughout all workshops, with examples given of how libraries coordinate and use volunteers for a variety of different functions, including digital literacy/skills.

Current issues with using volunteers (further discussed in other themes);

- Coordination of volunteers
- Commitment and reliability often a problem
- Safeguarding, privacy issues, permissions
  
  - Whilst many libraries did insist on DBS checks for regular volunteers it was considered not necessary when doing limited hours, working in open library areas, or in group sessions with staff members.
  
  - Volunteers need to be trained on how to deal with privacy issues ie. access to personal data when talking about shopping online or health issues when discussing health online.

Ideas & examples of utilising volunteers:

Recruitment

- Local Community Voluntary Services (CVS)
- Age UK - often enthusiastic and reliable although limited interest/skills in digital
- Barclays Digital Eagles
- Lloyds Digital Champions - register opportunities on www.ukonlinecentres.com
- Website/posters in library
- Duke of Edinburgh, Further Education or University students volunteering to boost their CV
- Other tips: always have a job profile to set expectations, ask for references and do interviews to ensure a good match

Training

- Workers Educational Alliance - free courses on skills for volunteers (Rotherham looking to expand this to skills for volunteers working on digital inclusion)
- Local CVS may offer training
- Age UK may offer training
Resources

- Some libraries have their own resources available for volunteers, but go out of date quickly
- Many libraries use LMW - tutor resources available
- Webinar/Google Hangouts to communicate with/train volunteers
- Other sources suggested www.clicktrafford.org - courtesy of Geoff Newell - Trafford Libraries; www.moneymatterstome.co.uk offer online shopping and banking simulators; www.moneyinstructor.com

Suggested delivery models

- Matching 1:1 volunteers and learners as per Aberdeenshire Libraries - building long term relationships.
- Volunteers as extra pair of hands in group sessions
- Volunteers offering 1:1 support to learners in crop in sessions
- Volunteers who deliver books to housebound could also introduce a digital element i.e. how to access and download ebooks (problematic where broadband/wifi unreliable/unavailable)
- Specific sessions utilising volunteers interests - Over 50s, Coding Clubs, Minecraft Clubs

More information and resources for working with, managing and training volunteers are available on www.ukonlinecentres.com

Theme 4) Welfare reform – digital by default support by library staff

The welfare reform changes and roll out of the UC system has resulted in an increase in the need for benefit claimants to complete online transactions with local and central Government. Users of the UC system have been systematically referred to libraries by agencies, such as the job centre, as providers of access and support for these online benefit services.

The overall feeling to this was one of resentment that the Department for Work & Pensions had not factored the impact of these changes to libraries. The main areas of concern were:

- Large increase in numbers of people coming to libraries for support
- Assisting and guiding users through the UC process can be labour-intensive, time-consuming and often involves one-to-one support
- Huge shift in the kind of support libraries and staff are providing
- Capacity of local libraries varies greatly
- No extra funding made available to libraries to support this service
What place does digital inclusion have in digital literacy?
Tinder Foundation/CILIP ILG TeachMeet Summary Report

- Increase in service provision at a time of reduction in staff and changing roles
- Users often want help at the point of turning up at the library, and don’t want to come back on another day for specific support

It was pointed out that the type of welfare support provided by libraries is not necessarily new, but the levels of demand for the service during a period of substantial ongoing cuts makes the impact and challenge even greater.

Some of the recommendations and suggestions discussed to help assist and support libraries delivering this service included:

- General assistance and direction from Government Services on how to use systems & what’s required would be beneficial
- Making use of volunteers to deal with increased need for support was considered valuable for specific tasks, but could be problematic when they lack the required skills, or create reputational issues where they are used in the handling of confidential or sensitive user information
- Coordination and partnership with other governmental and non-governmental agencies providing similar support, such as Citizens Advice Bureau, Job Centres, Housing Associations - joined up approaches, imaginative solutions, shared resources. Strategic approach at the regional/national level would be most effective
- Scope to link the information and digital literacy skills involved with other work undertaken by libraries in other practical skills, such as financial literacy
- Rationing of space/time in libraries to allow for and manage the increased number of users seeking access and support
- Targeting of clients - but the criteria(s) for this was not made clear
- Signposting to services and resources provided by other agencies which are designed to help, such as LMW
- Promote the use of LMW as a primary resource to provide support to people coming into the library for help with using Government online services such as UC - examples from libraries recommending LMW as an easy-to-use and one stop shop of courses to help with the needs people have - can be delivered unsupported, in one-to-ones, or through group sessions led by staff or volunteers

Specific case studies:

York Libraries - working with benefits team and Job Centre to do 1-to-1's and being funded by Tinder Foundation and the Council/Job Centre at just under £30 pp for providing Universal Credit assistance (no learners support yet & funding comes after support provided). LMW was used for the staff to become familiar with Universal Credit. Tinder Foundation funding has also helped them buy tablets - these are handed to users with UC/UJM/LMW preloaded.
Derbyshire Libraries - helping lots of people looking for work through Council funded project, which is seen as a priority. Another 2 year Work and Money project, provides 1-to-1 help provided by library staff on the Universal Job Match.

Wirral - merged with one shop from Council - has 2 agendas - shop for complaining, library for “nice things”, so different customer groups, but do refer to the library to get help for services and utilise volunteers to help.

It was considered that underlying this new area of library service support was a wider debate about the mission of libraries: should librarians be hand holding users through these services, or focus instead on teaching how to use services and ultimately create learning opportunities? The latter is more aligned with the ethos of information and digital literacy, but for librarians coping with the daily reality, there is a real tension between the two.

Theme 5) Using different digital devices

Plethora of digital devices used and brought to libraries by users: PCs, Laptops, Tablets, Smartphones, Breezies - bringing own devices is increasingly popular, and library culture should ‘catch up’ with this widely used real world approach as it could benefit staff and library users.

4 main themes arose:
- It was widely thought that sessions utilising digital devices are a bit ad-hoc with no coordination at a local or national level
- Staff lacked skills and confidence to run sessions
- Using digital device sessions were not delivered on the whole and if they were they were badly marketed
- Library culture needs to catch up with the ‘real world’ where Bring Your Own Device (BYOD) is popular

Several different example models of learning:
- 1-2-1 sessions run by keen staff/volunteers
- Group sessions - examples of volunteer-led sessions, sessions held in local cafes and pubs, pop up libraries, BYOD sessions in town centre locations
- Tech petting zoos (Plymouth/Manchester) - boxes of tech taken to different libraries, health centres, doctors, community centres etc. and demonstrated in hands-on sessions (funding/sponsorship opportunities)
- Barclays Digital Eagles run BYOD sessions in Bolton’s libraries
- **Learn My Way** - courses available which cover using devices and basic IT skills
The ‘hook’ for any session was considered to be essential to inspire involvement; ebooks, legally watching films online, top apps for holidays, top education apps for children, music streaming services, post xmas BYOD after people have received their devices as presents (could be national event).

**Barriers:**
- Management culture around IT - acceptable for staff to use devices at work and ‘play’ to learn new devices/apps etc. e.g. Leeds Library lend tech to staff for personal development
- Plethora of devices in existence - hard to master them all, some may be out of date, some may be brand new - therefore difficult to teach
- Concerns around security of devices
- Staff confidence
- Staff lacking skills to help
- Cultural shift i.e. older staff who don’t want to engage
- Lending of devices creates a variety of challenges around user agreements, security etc

**Ideas and examples of best practice:**
- Leeds Library downloading public domain audiobooks onto memory sticks for housebound customers
- Leeds Library also holding show and tells for staff e.g. raspberry pi, minecraft
- Newcastle Libraries ran a recent project demonstrating how to find and reuse public domain literature, art and music
- Halton Libraries have an open source library management system (only one in the UK)
- Staff can’t understand all the devices and answer all the problems, so need to be confident enough to say they “don’t know but will find out for next week”
- Aberdeenshire Libraries have sessions run by pupil volunteers with benefits for both pupils and learners
- Barclays Digital Eagles run BYOD sessions in Bolton Libraries
- Staff can have roaming devices - not restricted to desk but able to navigate the spaces of the library
- **Learn My Way** - numerous courses that cover using devices and basic IT skills
- There was interest in identifying if scope for staff accreditation in teaching with devices
Theme 6) Keeping staff up-to-date with new apps and digital services

A number of delegates mentioned that public libraries are not in a position to keep up-to-date with new apps and digital services as some staff don’t have the capability to use them. Reasons for this revolved around interrelated themes such as:

- Low levels of digital skills within library staff
- Lack of training - due to funding cuts, lack of time, not library specific, no initiative, or focus on one expert staff member
- Staff fear, resistance, or lack of knowledge around digital (not limited to older members of staff)
- Staff shortages/restructures/lack of resources
- Limited access to devices
- Local Authority Corporate IT/Marketing restrictions
- Not seen as a priority
- Reactive to technology rather than planning/leading

A number of ideas for keeping staff up-to-date were raised mainly focussing on embedding digital skills in staff, ongoing training, and peer support. These included:

- Time made available for training
- Online courses/eLearning platforms/Bitesize training
- Training should be available in different formats, tailored to roles, and interactive
- Learning could take the form of away days for all staff, taster sessions, self-guided, or peer support
- Accredited training (extrinsic motivation)
- Embed digital skills in all areas of the information profession - include in job descriptions, selection, and ongoing development
- Digital leaders or champions to be used to promote, cascade, and support take up of apps and services
- Learn from others e.g. Users, CILIP

In terms of who should be responsible to keep staff up-to-date:

- Management need to be ‘on-board’ and should be the role models to motivate staff, for example empowering staff to experiment and share personal passion for digital
- Staff take responsibility for their learning/development

There were a number of examples provided of how libraries and staff are keeping up-to-date with Apps and digital as part of their personal
development. Some delegates mentioned that library staff had attended SCL’s (Society of Chief Librarians) Digital Skills Leadership Course. Frontline examples included libraries who use drop-in sessions where staff share knowledge such as at Bolton Libraries “Share Digital” sessions where library staff can attend sessions and bring their own devices to learn and share from other members of staff. This is particularly of relevance as most delegates mentioned library staff who know about apps tend to be self taught and have an interest in digital. This shows that libraries may have an untapped resource of staff who can share their interest and enthusiasm in the potential of digital services and apps.

Leeds Library highlighted its own library app, developed by SOLUS which a number of delegates were interested to know more about. In addition delegates were keen to have access to a list of useful apps and digital services to use in the library. For example some delegates had not heard of LMW but would certainly be looking to use it in the future.
Event Evaluation

At the end of both TeachMeet events, delegates were asked to complete an event evaluation. Overall delegates agreed or strongly agreed that the objectives of the event were clear; the content was well presented and engaging; and that they had learned something useful for their role. When asked what delegates liked most about the event, feedback included overwhelmingly that delegates liked the experience of sharing ideas and experiences; meeting and learning from delegates from different library sectors; and learning how other delegates approach the shared challenge of digital inclusion. Delegates also praised the presenters and the selection and range of topics discussed. Some delegates mentioned that the event was too short, perhaps showing that there is scope for further events. Delegates from the London event also highlighted that it would have benefitted the event if some of the presentations were from public librarians, as they were all from staff from the HE sector. Also some delegates felt that the academic material was less relevant. When asked if there are any other information literacy topics or skills in which delegates would like to receive training, a number of responses related to more knowledge of social media, online tools and webinars; marketing techniques to hook learners to sign up for digital skills training; and more learning around digital inclusion and digital literacy. All of the feedback above will be used to inform future events and research.

TeachMeet Facilitators

**Facilitators - Leeds**
Jacqueline Geekie - CILIP ILG
Sue Lawson - CILIP PMLG
Alice Mathers - Tinder Foundation
Helen Milner - Tinder Foundation
Sharon Wagg - Tinder Foundation
Caroline Wilson - Tinder Foundation
Gabi Woodhams - Tinder Foundation

**Facilitators - London**
Leo Appleton - CILIP MMIT
Ben Brown - Tinder Foundation
Andra Fry - LSE
Stéphane Goldstein - CILIP ILG
Sonia Gomes - LSE
Jane Secker - CILIP ILG
Dianita Supriyanto - Tinder Foundation
Sam Taylor - Tinder Foundation
What place does digital inclusion have in digital literacy?
Tinder Foundation/CILIP ILG TeachMeet Summary Report

Next Steps

Carry on the conversation on The Digital Libraries Libraries Hub - a free online resource for library staff, volunteers, Heads of service, and anyone interested in digital inclusion to find peer support around the issues of delivering basic digital skills in libraries, accessing tools and resources, and discussing relevant issues affecting libraries nationally. Join the conversation at http://digitallibrarieshub.ning.com/

Follow the Libraries Digital Inclusion Action Research Project - last Autumn, Tinder Foundation - in partnership with the Leadership for Libraries Taskforce - launched a Library Digital Inclusion Fund for a six-month Library Digital Inclusion Action Research Project. Funds were awarded to 16 library authorities to participate in the action research project, to engage and support hard to reach learners, who are socially excluded, and to help them to develop basic digital skills using innovative models of delivery using WiFi and mobile technology as an enabler. The Research Project will finish in March 2016, with the final report expected in June 2016.

Download Tinder Foundation’s Doing Digital Inclusion: Libraries Handbook, which offers tips and resources for libraries looking to recruit learners and tackle digital exclusion.

Further Information

Tinder Foundation: hello@tinderfoundation.org or 0114 349 1666
CILIP ILG: cilipilg@gmail.com